FINAL REPORT

IMPLEMENTATION

OF

AGRICULTURAL INPUTS SUBSIDY PROGRAMME 2008/09

Logistics Unit April 2009

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| BACKGROUND | 3 |
|---|----|
| OUTCOME (EXECUTIVE SUMMARY) | 4 |
| Fertiliser | 4 |
| Seed | 5 |
| OVERALL COSTS | |
| RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE PROJECTS | 6 |
| FERTILISER PURCHASE | 6 |
| BENEFICIARY SELECTION | 6 |
| VOUCHER PRINTING AND DISTRIBUTION | 6 |
| APPOINTMENT OF TRANSPORTERS | 6 |
| ADMARC/SFFRFM INVOLVEMENT | 6 |
| IMPLEMENTATION DETAILS | 7 |
| GOVERNMENT FERTILISER PURCHASES 2008/09 | 7 |
| SUBSIDY FERTILISER DELIVERIES TO SFFRFM DEPOTS | 17 |
| UPLIFTS TO SFRFM/ADMARC UNIT MARKETS | 17 |
| VOUCHER PRINTING AND DISTRIBUTION | 21 |
| BENEFICIARY SELECTION | 21 |
| Points to Note | 23 |
| REDEMPTION OF VOUCHERS, SALES AND STOCK BALANCES IN MARKETS | 26 |
| FERTILISER SALES | 26 |
| SEED SALES | 28 |
| PROCED AND ME COSTS | 30 |

BACKGROUND

In 2008/2009, for the fourth consecutive year, the Government of Malawi, through the Ministry of Agriculture announced its intention to embark on an agricultural inputs subsidy programme. The mechanics of implementing the programme roughly followed the pattern of last year (2007/2008). However there were some significant changes. Both methodology and changes are listed below.

- Selected farmers throughout the country received fertiliser vouchers that could be exchanged for fertiliser when surrendering the voucher plus a cash "top up" of MK 800.00
- Selected farmers also received a seed voucher that could be exchanged for a seed package. This year, unlike last year, no cash "top up" was required to redeem the voucher.
- As happened last year, flexi vouchers were also distributed to selected farmers.
 These could be surrendered in exchange for a variety of seed types namely cotton, beans, pigeon peas, groundnuts or maize.
- The Government issued a tender for the purchase of 170,000 MTS fertiliser to be made available to the selected farmers at ADMARC and SFFRFM unit markets.
- The successful tenderers for the supply of Government fertiliser had to deliver their quota to three SFFRFM regional depots.
- From there the fertiliser was ferried by contracted local transporters to the ADMARC/SFFRFM unit markets from whence it was distributed to farmers in exchange for a voucher plus MK 800.
- The provision of seed to the farmers was the responsibility of recognised seed growers (eight in number) who undertook to stock both ADMARC/SFFRFM unit markets and rural agri- dealer outlets where the farmers could obtain the seed when surrendering the voucher.
- Once again towards the end of the programme (December/January) cotton chemical vouchers were introduced.

There were some significant changes in the programme approach from last year

 Unlike previous years, the Ministry of Agriculture HQ together with the District Agricultural Development Officers (DADOs) took responsibility for organising the printing, packing and distribution of all of the vouchers. The Logistics Unit's role in the beneficiary selection and voucher distribution process was reduced to recording the beneficiary names provided by the DADOs and subsequently producing the Beneficiary Registers to be used in the distribution of the vouchers.

- The farmer's contribution to the cost of the fertiliser provided was reduced from MK 900 per 50 kg bag (2007/08) to MK 800 per 50 kg bag (2008/2009)
- Unlike previous years, no agriculture inputs retailers with rural outlets were authorised to accept the fertiliser vouchers in exchange for fertiliser supplied by these retailers

OUTCOME (EXECUTIVE SUMMARY)

Fertiliser

According to Ministry of Agriculture information, 3.926 million fertiliser vouchers (1.758 million NPK, 1.768 million Urea, 0.200 million D Compound, and 0.200 million CAN vouchers) were distributed to farmers in the districts between early November and late December

Reconciliation with the sales figures would indicate that a further 119,560 vouchers were in circulation..

Through the scheme, farmers paid MK 800 for a 50kg bag of fertiliser irrespective of the type of fertiliser or area in which it was purchased.

Government provided a total of 218,462 MTS for distribution in the subsidy scheme. 32,704 MTS was available through the "buy back" scheme and 185,758 MTS was from direct purchases during 2009.

Net cost of the above fertiliser was MK 36,751,153,959

Uplifts to the ADMARC/SFFRFM unit markets, small holder tea and coffee growers and the millennium village project amounted to 206,541 MTS leaving a balance of 11,921 MTS in the SFFRFM depots.

The Government also commissioned 24,500MTS of fertiliser for flood relief at a cost of MK 4,296,996,393. At time of publishing this was still in the SFFRFM depots

202,278 MTS of fertiliser were bought by farmers through the 2008/09 agricultural inputs project

The breakdown by type was NPK (90,577 MTS), Urea (91,732 MTS), D Compound (10,390 MTS) and CAN (9,579 MTS)

ADMARC and SFFRFM were responsible for selling 169,081 MTS and 33,197 MTS respectively of the fertiliser purchased by farmers through the scheme

ADMARC/SFFRFM voucher recovery expressed in MTS was 198,055 MTS leaving a small unaccounted balance of 4,223 MTS (2 %)

Seed

1.5 million maize seed vouchers were to be distributed to farmers in the districts between early November and late December.

In addition 1,000,000 flexible vouchers were to be distributed to farmers in the districts in November. These could be exchanged for seed covering cotton, beans, pigeon peas, groundnuts or maize.

Both types of vouchers carried a value of MK 680 when exchanged for seed.

Eight recognised seed breeders were authorised by Government to trade in vouchers in exchange for seed.

These eight organisations through their traditional district selling partners made seed available at these outlets in the following packages;

Hybrid seed 2kgs (Pannar, Monsanto, Seed Co)

OPV seed 4kgs (Seed Co, Demeter, Funwe, AISAM)

Cotton seed 5kgs (Cargill, Great Lakes)

It is calculated that the maize seed made available to farmers through the scheme amounted to 4,532 MTS hybrid and 833 MTS OPV.

8,536 vouchers were redeemed for cotton seed through the scheme.

Only 316 flexible vouchers were redeemed for other seeds (groundnuts, beans, pigeon peas

Government made available cotton chemical packs (two types) to be issued free to cotton growers through Cargill and Great Lakes

In December/January 200,000 vouchers for each type of cotton chemicals were authorised to be issued through the ADDs. These have a redemption value of MK 50 each.

The number of chemical cotton vouchers redeemed is unknown as redemption had not started when this final report was issued.

Overall Costs

The known costs of the subsidy programme, exclusive of ADMARC/SFFRFM/MoA HQ, bank charges and district operational costs etc. was MK 39,827,998,362.

Based on the sale of 202,278 MT, Government should be able to recover MK 3,236,448,000 through the ADMARC/SFFRFM sales to farmers.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE PROJECTS

Fertiliser purchase

Design of the fertiliser tender should place the responsibility of declaring the delivery schedule with the tenderer. This would permit the introduction of a penalty clause should the supplier fail to meet the declared delivery dates

In the interests of expanding agro dealer activity in rural areas, consideration should be given to reintroducing private retailers as agents for subsidised fertiliser sales

Award of fertiliser tenders should be made within 14 days of submission to reduce price rise risk.

Extension of contracts during the programme should be restricted to essential demands such as replacing quantities where suppliers fail to deliver.

Beneficiary selection

District allocations of the quantities of fertiliser to be distributed should be made before mid August

A formula should be developed that gives transparency to the method behind district allocations

Beneficiary selection should be completed before the end of September to ensure that commencement of sales dovetail with deliveries to markets .

Voucher Printing and Distribution

Printing of vouchers should be strictly limited to the numbers required to service the agreed programme

The printing of vouchers without district identification numbers should be discontinued as it opens up the programme to abuse.

Should printing of vouchers within Malawi be contemplated again, the need for the importation of high security paper is self evident

Appointment of Transporters

To avoid warehouse storage congestion, transporters should be selected before the end of August to ensure that uplifts to markets coincide with fertiliser arrivals at SFFRFM depots

All appointed transporters should carry insurance cover for theft of cargo by employee or other persons.

ADMARC/SFFRFM Involvement

Adequate funding of ADMARC/SFFRFM operational costs should be in place before August to ensure unit markets are in readiness before August end.

IMPLEMENTATION DETAILS

Government Fertiliser Purchases 2008/09

On 26th April 2008 the Ministry of Agriculture issued bidding documents to a number of bidders covering 170,000 MTS of fertiliser to be purchased for the forthcoming subsidy programme. Bids were scheduled for return on 6th June 2008 at which time there was a public opening in the Ministry of Agriculture. Bids had to be in lots indicating the amount that would be supplied to the intended destination depots of Blantyre (Chirimba SFFRFM), Lilongwe (Kanengo SFFRFM) and Mzuzu (Luwinga SFFRFM)

The following table gives a summary of the bids received

| | | Quantity | | |
|----------------------------------|-----------|------------|-----------------|-------------|
| BIDDER | Commodity | (Mt) | Unit Price (\$) | Destination |
| Mlambe Limited | | 30,696.900 | 840.00 | Blantyre |
| | | | | |
| Agricultural Resources | CAN | 1,300.000 | 886.00 | Blantyre |
| | CAN | 1,300.000 | 897.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA | 5,850.000 | 1,133.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 5,850.000 | 1,144.00 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK | 5,750.000 | 1,758.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 5,750.000 | 1,764.00 | Lilongwe |
| | | | | |
| MULLI BROTHERS | UREA | 5,000.000 | 1,135.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 5,000.000 | 1,140.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA | 9,700.000 | 1,090.00 | Mzuzu |
| | NPK | 1,300.000 | 1,590.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 1,300.000 | 1,600.00 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK | 1,300.000 | 1,620.00 | Mzuzu |
| | | | | |
| SIMAMA | UREA | 9,000.000 | 1,201.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 9,000.000 | 1,221.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA | 6,000.000 | 1,221.00 | Mzuzu |
| | | , | , | |
| | NPK | 6,000.000 | 1,221.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 4,000.000 | 1,499.00 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK | 2,000.000 | 1,499.00 | Mzuzu |
| | | | , | |
| Unit Adminstration | UREA | 12,500.000 | 795.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 2,500.000 | 1,195.00 | Blantyre |
| | | , | , | |
| | | | | Lilongwe/ |
| ANBECO | UREA | 12,500.000 | 950.00 | Mzuzu |
| | | | | |
| Pioneer Investments | UREA | 12,500.000 | 850.00 | Blantyre |
| | | | | |
| Mtemadanga Distributors Ltd | UREA | 6,500.000 | 801.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 6,000.000 | 811.00 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK | 6,500.000 | 1,050.00 | Blantyre |
| | | 6,000.000 | 1,060.00 | Lilongwe |
| | | | | |
| Progressive Procurement Partners | UREA | 5,000.000 | MK112,700.00 | Blantyre |

| | UREA | 5,000.000 | MK114,100.00 | Lilongwe |
|--------------------------------|--------|------------|----------------|-----------|
| | NPK | 5,000.000 | MK154,000.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 5,000.000 | MK155,000.00 | Lilongwe |
| | | | | |
| MAPETO WHOLESALERS | UREA | 25,000.000 | 680.00 | |
| OMNIA FERTILISER LTD | NPK | 2,000.000 | 1,350.00 | Lilongwe |
| OMNIA FERTILISER LTD | CAN | 2,000.000 | 900.00 | Lilongwe |
| | CAN | 2,000.000 | 900.00 | Lilongwe |
| OPM General Dealers | UREA | 2,000.000 | 895.00 | |
| Agricultural & Inputs Supliers | | 15,000.000 | 865.00 | |
| | | | | |
| AGORA | D COMP | 1,300.000 | 1,445.00 | Blantyre |
| | D COMP | 1,700.000 | 1,456.00 | Lilongwe |
| | CAN | 1,000.000 | 880.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 1,000.000 | 1,091.08 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 2,000.000 | 1,437.00 | Blantyre |
| COMMERCIAL TRADING | NPK | 1,800.000 | MIZ 127 540 00 | Diantrino |
| COMMERCIAL TRADING | NPK | 1,800.000 | MK137,540.00 | Blantyre |
| FARMERS WORLD | CAN | 2,000.000 | 891.00 | Lilongwe |
| Trindizio (Cidz) | UREA | 2,000.000 | 1,100.43 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK | 7,500.000 | 1,449.00 | Lilongwe |
| | | , | , | 3,111 |
| OPTICHEM | D COMP | 4,500.000 | 1,440.00 | Lilongwe |
| | D COMP | 6,132.000 | 1,435.00 | Mzuzu |
| | | 5,202.000 | | |
| | NPK | 5,000.000 | 1,420.00 | Blantyre |
| MFC | UREA | 2,750.000 | 1,090.92 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 1,000.000 | 1,102.38 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK | 5,000.000 | 1,430.00 | Blantyre |
| | | | | |
| Malawi Investments Corporation | UREA | 6,000.000 | 803.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 6,500.000 | 813.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA | 12,437.000 | 828.00 | Mzuzu |
| | NPK | 6,000.000 | 1,070.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 6,500.000 | 1,080.00 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK | 12,437.000 | 1,095.00 | Mzuzu |
| SFFRFM | NPK | 16,000.000 | MK176,364.00 | Blantyre |
| <u></u> | NPK | 16,000.000 | MK208,740.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA | 5,000.000 | MK134,616.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 10,000.000 | MK136,178.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA | 5,000.000 | MK140,864.00 | Mzuzu |
| D.L.D. | 0.437 | 0.400.000 | 201.55 | T '' |
| RAB | CAN | 2,400.000 | 901.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA 1 | 3,000.000 | 1,128.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA 2 | 3,000.000 | 1,138.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA 1 | 10,000.000 | 1,138.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA 2 | 10,000.000 | 1,148.0 | Lilongwe |

| | NPK 1 | 2,000.000 | 1,578.60 | Blantyre |
|----------------------------|-------------|------------------|---------------|---------------|
| | NPK 2 | 2,000.000 | 1,740.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK 1 | 3,000.000 | 1,578.60 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK 2 | 3,000.000 | 1,750.00 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK 3 | 1,300.000 | 1,760.00 | Lilongwe |
| | TVI IX 5 | 1,500.000 | 1,700.00 | Dioligwe |
| TRANSGLOBE | UREA | 10,000.000 | 1,090.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 10,000.000 | 1,100.00 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK - | | | |
| | Granular | 1,500.000 | 1,435.00 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK - | | | |
| | Granular | 2,500.000 | 1,450.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK - Blend | 4,000.000 | 1,435.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK - Blend | 3,000.000 | 1,450.00 | Lilongwe |
| Consortium & Trade Group | UREA | 5,000.000 | 998.95 | Lilongwe |
| CEAL AND | TIDE A | 7 000 000 | 1.116.00 | D1 |
| SEALAND | UREA | 5,000.000 | 1,116.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 5,000.000 | 1,134.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA | 5,000.000 | 1,143.00 | Mzuzu |
| | NPK | 2,500.000 | 1,475.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 2,500.000 | 1,475.00 | Lilongwe |
| NYIOMBO | UREA | 14,000.000 | 1,099.00 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 14,000.000 | 1,107.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA | 7,000.000 | 1,126.00 | Mzuzu |
| | NPK | 5,000.000 | 1,426.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 5,000.000 | 1,434.00 | Lilongwe |
| | NPK | 5,000.000 | 1,453.00 | Mzuzu |
| | IVIK | 3,000.000 | 1,433.00 | IVIZUZU |
| IVORY INVESTEMENTS | UREA | 12,500.000 | 850.00 | Lilongwe |
| AQUA TRADERS | UREA | 12,500.000 | 850.00 | Blantyre |
| X7: 11: | | | | |
| Yianakkis general Import & | TIDEA | 5 000 000 | MIZ100 127 42 | D1 a saturari |
| Export | UREA | 5,000.000 | MK198,126.43 | Blantyre |
| | UREA | 5,000.000 | MK202,958.78 | Lilongwe |
| PACIFIC LTD | UREA | 31,866.350 | 900.00 | Lilongwe |
| EXPORT TRADING | UREA | 6,500.000 | 1,125.00 | Blantyre |
| LAI OKI IKADING | UREA | 6,500.000 | | • |
| | | | 1,125.00 | Lilongwe |
| | UREA | 2,000.000 | 1,150.00 | Mzuzu |
| | NPK | 5,000.000 | 1,465.00 | Blantyre |
| | NPK | 6,500.000 | 1,455.00 | Lilongwe |

A multi organisation evaluation committee was then formed and met in Salima over the period 11th -14th June 2008 to consider the above. The committee was advised of the targets for the fertiliser to be delivered to each of the three SFFRFM depots and was made aware of the volume of fertiliser that would be available at the destination depots through existing "buy back" stocks (32,707 MTS) and direct supply by SFFRFM (52,000 MTS).

Consequently the committee's recommendation was to be based on supplying the amount required in each depot to ensure the buy back plus the SFFRFM allocation plus the committee recommendation provided the targeted amount. The tables below shows the amounts intended from each source.

| Depot | Fertiliser | Target | Buy back | SFFRFM | Purchases |
|----------|------------|---------|----------|--------|-----------|
| Chirimba | NPK | 30,697 | 9,704 | 16,000 | 4,992 |
| | Urea | 30,697 | 3,197 | 5,000 | 22,499 |
| | D | 1,300 | 418 | | 882 |
| | compound | | | | |
| | CAN | 1,300 | 860 | | 440 |
| Kanengo | NPK | 31,866 | 5,443 | 16,000 | 10,423 |
| | Urea | 31,866 | 856 | 10,000 | 21,011 |
| | D | 6,132 | 1,722 | | 4,410 |
| | compound | | | | |
| | CAN | 6,132 | 0 | | 6,132 |
| Luwinga | NPK | 12,437 | 4,239 | | 8,198 |
| | Urea | 12,437 | 6,176 | 5,000 | 1,261 |
| | D | 2,568 | 218 | | 2,350 |
| | compound | | | | |
| | CAN | 2,568 | 14 | | 2,554 |
| | Total | 170,000 | 32,847 | 52,000 | 85,152 |

The deliberations of the evaluation committee resulted in the following recommendations being sent to the Ministry of Agriculture and Food Security

| EVALUAT | | | | | |
|-------------------|---------------------|----------------------|-----------------|--------------------------|---------------|
| | SFFRFM Chirimba | | | | |
| Supplier | NPK (target 4,992) | UREA (target 22,499) | D (target 882) | CAN (target 440) | Total cost \$ |
| Optichem | 1,300 | | | | 1,846,000.00 |
| Nyiombo | 1,846 | 5,000 | | | 8,127,528.00 |
| MFC | 1,846 | 2,750 | | | 5,639,942.00 |
| Transglobe | | 5,000 | | | 5,450,000.00 |
| Agora | | 1,300 | 1,300 | 1,000 | 4,176,904.00 |
| SFFRFM | | 5,000 | | | 4,740,000.00 |
| Sealand | | 3,449 | | | 5,087,930.00 |
| Total Chirimba | 4,992 | 22,499 | 1,300 | 1,000 | 35,068,304.00 |
| | | | | | |
| | SFFRFM Kanengo | | | | |
| Supplier | NPK (target 10,423) | UREA (target 21,011) | D Target 4,410) | CAN (target 6,132) | Total cost \$ |
| Omnia | 2,000 | | | 3,066 | 5,459,400.00 |
| Nyiombo | 2,500 | 4,000 | | | 8,013,000.00 |
| Transglobe | 1,712 | 4,711 | | | 7,637,962.00 |

| Export | | | | | 4,757,653.00 |
|----------|-------------|--------------|----------|---------|----------------|
| Trading | 1,712 | 2,000 | | | , , |
| Farmers | | | | | 8,555,166.00 |
| World | 2,500 | 2,000 | | 3,066 | |
| SFFRFM | | 7,000 | | | 6,713,000.00 |
| MFC | | 1,300 | | | 1,433,094.00 |
| | | | | | 2,475,200.00 |
| Agora | | | 1,700 | | |
| | | | | | 3,902,832.00 |
| Optichem | | | 2,710 | | |
| Tota1 | 10,423 | 21,011 | 4,410 | 6,132 | 48,947,307.00 |
| Kanengo | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | SFFRFM | | | | |
| | Luwinga | | | | |
| Supplier | NPK (target | UREA (target | D Target | CAN | Total cost \$ |
| | 8,198) | 1,261) | (2,350) | (target | |
| | | | | 2,554) | |
| Mulli | 1,300 | 1,261 | | | 3,562,900.00 |
| Simama | 2,000 | | | | 2,998,000.00 |
| Nyiombo | 4,898 | | | | 7,116,920.00 |
| Optichem | | | 2,350 | | 3,466,324.00 |
| Tota1 | 8,198 | 1,261 | 2,350 | 0 | 17,144,144.00 |
| Luwinga | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| Total | 23,614 | 44,771 | 8,060 | 7,132 | 101,159,755.00 |
| Tonnage | | | | | |

On the 29th July 2008, the following awards were made by Government

| | SFFRFM Chirimba | | | | |
|-------------|--------------------|-----------|----------|----------|---------------|
| Supplier | NPK | UREA | D | CAN | Total cost \$ |
| | | | Compound | | |
| Optichem | 1,300.00 | | | | 1,846,000.00 |
| Nyiombo | 3,047.00 | 7,000.00 | | | 12,038,022.00 |
| MFC | 1,246.09 | 3,000.00 | | | 5,054,669.00 |
| SFFRFM | 9,206.10 | 2,000.00 | | | 13,329,976.00 |
| Sealand | 2,500.00 | 2,100.44 | | | 6,031,591.00 |
| Mulli | 2,000.00 | 4,099.00 | | | 7,832,365.00 |
| Export trad | 1,693.00 | 2,000.44 | | | 4,730,740.00 |
| Agora | | 1,300.00 | 881.90 | 3,505.95 | 5,777,986.00 |
| Pioneer | | 6,000.00 | | | 5,100,000.00 |
| Total | 20,992.19 | 27,499.88 | 881.90 | 3,505.95 | 61,741,349.00 |
| Chirimba | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | SFFRFM | | | | |
| | Kanengo | | | | |
| Supplier | NPK | UREA | D | CAN | Total cost \$ |

| | | | Compound | | |
|--------------|-----------|-----------|----------|----------|---------------|
| Nyiombo | 4,000.00 | 7,000.00 | | | 13,485,000.00 |
| Transglobe | | 2,000.60 | | | 2,200,660.00 |
| Export Trad | 2,000.00 | 2,000.00 | | | 5,180,000.00 |
| Farmers Wrld | 2,500.00 | 2,000.00 | | 3,940.00 | 9,333,900.00 |
| Simama | 2,711.71 | | | | 4,064,853.00 |
| SFFRFM | 11,711.71 | | | | 17,216,214.00 |
| Sealand | 3,500.00 | 4,000.00 | | | 9,698,500.00 |
| MFC | | 1,050.00 | | | 1,157,499.00 |
| Pioneer | | 4,000.00 | | | 3,448,000.00 |
| Mulli Brs | | 8,960.00 | | | 10,214,400.00 |
| Agora | | | 1,700.00 | | 2,475,200.00 |
| Optichem | | | 5,067.86 | | 7,297,718.00 |
| Total | 26,423.42 | 31,010.60 | 6,767.86 | 3,940.00 | 85,771,944.00 |
| Kanengo | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | SFFRFM | | | | |
| | Luwinga | | | | |
| Supplier | NPK | UREA | D | CAN | Total cost \$ |
| | | | Compound | | |
| Simama | 3,000.00 | | | | 4,497,000.00 |
| Nyiombo | 5,197.18 | 2,500.00 | | | 10,366,503.00 |
| Mulli Bros | | 1,261.39 | | | 1,456,900.00 |
| Pioneer | | 2,500.00 | | | 2,185,000.00 |
| Optichem | | | 2,350.05 | | 3,466,324.00 |
| Total | 8,197.18 | 6,261.39 | 2,350.05 | | 21,971,727.00 |
| Luwinga | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| Total | 55,613 | 64,772 | 10,000 | 7,446 | 169,485,020 |
| Tonnage | | | | | |

Although the actual awards were very different from the evaluation recommendations, it should be noted that the 52,000 MTS from SFFRFM originally factored into the supply equation was no longer part of the supply chain. Consequently the amount envisaged as being available for the subsidy programme was still only 170,678 MTS coming from 137,831 from the suppliers and 32,704 MTS from the "buy back".

One significant departure from the evaluation recommendation was the decision to award 12,500 MTS urea to Pioneer . The evaluation committee had considered this company's proposal to be an unresponsive bid because of the unrealistically low unit price submitted.

The anticipated depot delivery volumes arising from these awards is shown in the table below.

| SFFRFM Chirimba | NPK | UREA | D | CAN |
|-----------------|-----------|-----------|----------|----------|
| | | | Compound | |
| Via Supplier | 20,992.19 | 27,499.88 | 881.90 | 3,505.95 |
| Buy Back Stocks | 9,704.00 | 3,197.00 | 418.00 | 860.00 |

| Total SR Tonnage | 30,696.19 | 30,696.88 | 1,299.90 | 4,365.95 |
|------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|----------|
| | | | | |
| SFFRFM Kanengo | NPK | UREA | D | CAN |
| | | | Compound | |
| Via Supplier | 26,423.42 | 31,010.60 | 6,767.86 | 3,940.00 |
| Buy Back Stocks | 5,443.00 | 856.00 | 1,722.00 | |
| Total CR Tonnage | 31,866.42 | 31,866.60 | 8,489.86 | 3,940.00 |
| | | | | |
| SFFRFM Luwinga | NPK | UREA | D | CAN |
| | | | Compound | |
| Via Supplier | 8,197.18 | 6,261.39 | 2,350.05 | |
| Buy Back Stocks | 4,239.00 | 6,176.00 | 218.00 | 14.00 |
| Total NR Tonnage | 12,436.18 | 12,437.39 | 2,568.05 | 14.00 |
| National Total | 74,998.79 | 75,000.87 | 12,357.81 | 8,319.95 |

This was the position at the end of July 2008. At this point no district allocation had been published and no beneficiaries had been selected. Consequently what the demands would be on each depot was unknown. However, although there was a reasonable balance between urea and NPK in each depot, the same could not be said regarding CAN and D compound. All pre programme documents indicated that the programme was to cover 75,000 MTS each of NPK and Urea and 10,000 MTS each of CAN and D compound, Consequently the award meant that inadequate CAN had been commissioned.

On 29th September,2008 the amount of fertiliser available to the programme was increased by the award of an additional 8,000 MTS to Transglobe, as shown below.

| Depot | NPK | Urea |
|----------|-------|-------|
| _ | (MTS) | (MTS) |
| Kanengo | 2,500 | 2,500 |
| Chirimba | 1,500 | 1,500 |
| total | 4,000 | 4,000 |

The position regarding availability of fertiliser to the subsidy programme changed yet again in early October when it was learned that the Pioneer contract for 12,500 MTS of urea had been terminated as a result of failure to deliver. Partly to compensate, the following extensions to existing contracts were made.

| Company | Chirimba | | Kanengo | | Luwinga | |
|---------------|----------|-------|---------|-------|---------|-------|
| | (MTS) | | (MTS) | | (MTS) | |
| | Urea | NPK | Urea | | Urea | |
| Agora | 3,000 | | | | | |
| Farmers World | | | | 3,000 | | |
| Sealand | 1,000 | | | | | 4,500 |
| Simama | 2,000 | 1,500 | | | | |
| Mulli | 1,000 | | | 1,000 | | |
| Total | 7,000 | 1,500 | | 4,000 | | 4,500 |

During December and early January there was yet a further change in the amount of fertiliser available to the programme when various companies were awarded extensions to their existing contracts as shown below,

| | Chirimba | | Kaneng | Kanengo | | Luwinga (MTS) | |
|---------------|----------|-------|--------|---------|-------|---------------|-------|
| | (MTS) | | (MTS) | (MTS) | | | |
| Company | Urea | NPK | Urea | NPK | Urea | NPK | CAN |
| Mulli | 3,000 | 1,000 | 3,000 | 1,000 | | | 1,698 |
| Sealand | 1,500 | | 1,500 | | 1,000 | 2,000 | |
| Simama | 200 | 2,000 | 500 | 2,500 | | 500 | |
| Nyiombo | 1,000 | | 2,000 | 300 | 2,000 | 700 | |
| Farmers World | | | 2,500 | 2,500 | 1,500 | 1,500 | |
| Total | 5,700 | 3,000 | 10,000 | 6,300 | 4,500 | 4,700 | 1,698 |

As a result of the above, during the course of the programme the following quantities were commissioned for the fertliser subsidy programme through suppliers and "buy back"

| SFFRFM | NPK | UREA | D | CAN |
|-----------------|-----------|------------|-----------|-----------|
| Chirimba | | | Compound | |
| Via Supplier | 26,992.19 | 35,699.88 | 881.9 | 3,505.95 |
| Buy Back Stocks | 9,704.00 | 3,197.00 | 418 | 860.00 |
| Total SR | 36,696.19 | 38,896.88 | 1299.9 | 4,365.95 |
| Tonnage | | | | |
| | | | | |
| SFFRFM | NPK | UREA | D | CAN |
| Kanengo | | | Compound | |
| Via Supplier | 35,223.42 | 43,010.60 | 6,767.86 | 3,940.00 |
| Buy Back Stocks | 5,443.00 | 856.00 | 1,722.00 | |
| Total CR | 40,666.42 | 43,866.6 | 8,489.86 | 3,940.00 |
| Tonnage | | | | |
| | | | | |
| SFFRFM | NPK | UREA | D | CAN |
| Luwinga | | | Compound | |
| Via Supplier | 12,897.18 | 12,761.39 | 2,350.05 | 1,698.00 |
| Buy Back Stocks | 4,239.00 | 6,176.00 | 218 | 14.00 |
| Total NR | 17,136.18 | 18,937.39 | 2,568.05 | 1,712.00 |
| Tonnage | | | | |
| National Total | 94,498.79 | 101,700.87 | 12,357.81 | 10,017.95 |

A breakdown of actual delivery by company and cost incurred is given below

| | SFFRFM Chirimba | | | | |
|----------|--------------------|------|----------|-----|---------------|
| Supplier | NPK | UREA | D | CAN | Total cost \$ |
| | | | Compound | | |
| Optichem | 1,300.00 | | | | 1,846,000.00 |

| Nyiombo | 4,920.20 | 8,000.00 | | | 15,808,204.80 |
|-------------------|-----------|-----------|---------------|----------|----------------|
| MFC | 1,246.10 | 3,000.05 | | | 5,052,337.51 |
| SFFRFM | 9,206.10 | 2,000.00 | | | 13,329,976.20 |
| Sealand | 2,500.00 | 4,600.44 | | | 8,821,591.04 |
| Mulli Brothers | 3,000.00 | 8,104.20 | | | 13,968,267.00 |
| Export Trad | 1,693.00 | 2,000.00 | | | 4,730,245.00 |
| Agora | | 4,300.30 | 1707.70 | 1,727.60 | 8,679,885.82 |
| Transglobe | 1,500.00 | 1,500.00 | | | 3,787,500.00 |
| Simama | 3,500.00 | 2,200.00 | | | 8,284,966.01 |
| Farmers World | 1904.75 | 2,001.00 | | | 4,922,885.88 |
| Total Chirimba | 30,770.15 | 37,705.99 | 1,707.70 | 1,727.60 | 89,231,859.26 |
| | | | | | |
| | SFFRFM | | | | |
| | Kanengo | | | | |
| Supplier | NPK | UREA | D Compound | CAN | Total cost \$ |
| Nyiombo | 4,300.00 | 9,000.00 | | | 16,129,200.00 |
| Transglobe | 2,500.00 | 4,534.55 | | | 8,611,176.50 |
| Export Trad | 2,000.00 | 2,000.00 | | | 5,160,000.00 |
| Farmers World | 3,095.30 | 5,497.80 | | 3,940.04 | 14,045,609.39 |
| Simama | 5,207.50 | 500.05 | | | 8,664,320.56 |
| SFFRFM | 11,711.71 | | | | 17,216,213.70 |
| Sealand | 3,500.00 | 5,499.90 | | | 11,399,386.60 |
| MFC | | 1,062.80 | | | 1,171,609.46 |
| Mulli Brothers | 1,000.00 | 12,960.00 | | | 16,374,400.00 |
| Agora | | | 874.1 | 1,778.35 | 2,857,199.45 |
| Optichem | | | 5,067.10 | | 7,296,624.00 |
| Total Kanengo | 33,314.51 | 41,055.10 | 5,941.20 | 5,718.39 | 108,925,739.66 |
| Tunengo | | | | | |
| | SFFRFM | | | | |
| 0 1' | Luwinga | TIDEA | D | CAN | TD 4.1 4.0 |
| Supplier | NPK | UREA | D Compound | CAN | Total cost \$ |
| Simama | 3,500.00 | | | | 5,306,148.09 |
| Nyiombo | 4,024.00 | 4,500.00 | | | 10,913,872.00 |
| Mulli Brothers | | 1,261.40 | | 1,682.00 | 2,972,826.00 |
| Farmers World | 1,500.00 | 1,499.93 | | | 3,899,066.22 |
| Sealand | 2,000.00 | 5,500.00 | | | 9,592,500.00 |
| Optichem | | | 2,350.05 | | 3,466,323.75 |
| Total | 11,024.00 | 12,761.33 | 2,350.05 | 1,682.00 | 36,150,736.06 |
| Luwinga | | | | | |
| | | | | | |

| Total | Tonnage | | | | | \$ |
|-------|---------|-----------|-----------|----------|----------|----------------|
| | _ | 75,108.66 | 91,522.42 | 9,998.95 | 9,127.99 | 234,308,334.98 |

As a result of the above deliveries the following quantities of subsidised fertiliser were available in total for uplift to the ADMARC unit markets in the districts. It will be noted that when a physical count of the "buy back" stocks was carried out, slight differences were discovered from the initial totals advised

| SFFRFM | NPK | UREA | D | CAN |
|------------------|-----------|------------|-----------|-----------|
| Chirimba | | | Compound | |
| Via Supplier | 30,770.15 | 37,705.99 | 1,707.70 | 1,727.60 |
| Buy Back Stocks | 9,704.47 | 3,197.21 | 418.10 | 860.25 |
| Total SR Tonnage | 40,474.62 | 40,903.20 | 2,125.8 | 2,587.85 |
| | | | | |
| SFFRFM | NPK | UREA | D | CAN |
| Kanengo | | | Compound | |
| Via Supplier | 33,314.51 | 41,055.10 | 5,941.20 | 5,718.39 |
| Buy Back Stocks | 5,442.93 | 855.75 | 1,721.70 | |
| Total CR Tonnage | 38,757.44 | 41,910.85 | 7,662.90 | 5,718.39 |
| | | | | |
| SFFRFM | NPK | UREA | D | CAN |
| Luwinga | | | Compound | |
| Via Supplier | 11,024.00 | 12,761.33 | 2,350.05 | 1,682.00 |
| Buy Back Stocks | 4,175.95 | 6,090.70 | 221.20 | 15.80 |
| Total NR | 15,199.95 | 18,852.03 | 2,571.25 | 1,697.80 |
| Tonnage | | | | |
| National Total | 94,432.01 | 101,666.08 | 12,359.95 | 10,004.04 |

In addition to the above, in mid January 2009, the Ministry of Agriculture once again extended some of the existing contracts when 24,500 MTS of fertiliser were ordered in the name of flood relief. The details of this order are shown below

| KANENGO | | | rate/tonne\$ | Cost US \$ |
|--------------------|------------|----------|--------------|--------------|
| Supplier | Туре | Tonnes | | |
| Nyiombo | Urea | 4,000.00 | 1,107.00 | 4,428,000.00 |
| Mulli Brothers | NPK | 500.00 | 1,600.00 | 800,000.00 |
| | Urea | 3,000.00 | 1,140.00 | 3,420,000.00 |
| Transglobe Produce | | | | |
| Exports | NPK | 1,000.00 | 1,435.00 | 1,435,000.00 |
| LUWINGA | | | | |
| Nyiombo | Urea | 4,260.00 | 1,126.00 | 4,796,760.00 |
| Mulli Brothers | Urea | 1,000.00 | 1,155.00 | 1,155,000.00 |
| CHIRIMBA | | | | |
| Nyiombo | Urea | 1,740.00 | 1,099.00 | 1,912,260.00 |
| Optichem | NPK | 5,000.00 | 1,420.00 | 7,100,000.00 |
| Transglobe | NPK | 1,000.00 | 1,435.00 | 1,435,000.00 |
| Mulli Brothers | NPK | 1,000.00 | 1,590.00 | 1,590,000.00 |
| | Urea | 2,000.00 | 1,135.00 | 2,270,000.00 |
| | Total Cost | | | |

| (US\$) | \$30,342,020.00 |
|----------|-----------------|
| [(US\$) | \$30,342,020.00 |

Subsidy Fertiliser Deliveries to SFFRFM Depots

The foregoing section details the history behind the quantity of fertiliser that was finally made available for distribution in connection with the subsidy programme The fertiliser started to arrive in August 2008 and was finally all delivered in January 2009. The monthly rate of delivery (MTS) is recorded in the table produced below

| | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Jan | Total |
|----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|------------|
| NPK | 5,168.85 | 11,029.75 | 20,665.46 | 14,764.80 | 16,636.06 | 6,843.75 | 75,108.66 |
| Urea | 18,551.45 | 19,911.34 | 15,149.26 | 13,572.36 | 19,480.94 | 4,857.07 | 91,522.42 |
| D | | | | | | | |
| compound | 841.65 | 2,174.45 | 690.05 | 3,488.15 | 3,136.55 | 5,941.20 | 9,998.95 |
| CAN | - | - | 3,886.05 | 1,190.10 | 2,264.14 | 1,787.70 | 9,127.99 |
| Total | 24,561.95 | 33,115.54 | 40,390.82 | 33,015.41 | 35,244.59 | 19,429.72 | 185,758.02 |

As noted later in this report, appointment of transporters only took place at the beginning of September and sales did not commence until November. By that time over 140,000 MTS had been made available for the programme and as a result all SFFRFM warehouses were facing saturation. Consequently alternative temporary warehousing had to be found for over 14,500 MTS in the Southern Region, 5,000 MTS in the Central Region and 3,500 MTS in the Northern Region.

Uplifts to SFRFM/ADMARC Unit Markets

As noted above uplifts to the ADMARC and SFFRFM markets did not commence at the same time as the fertiliser deliveries into the SFFRFM depots, resulting in storage problems developing particularly in the Southern Region.

Although the Ministry of Agriculture and Food Security commenced considering the appointment of transporters to carry out the uplift in early July 2008, a restricted tender document requesting bids was only issued to 16 selected transporters in mid August. Return date was 29th August 2008. Letters of acceptance were eventually issued on 9th September.

Original transporters selected by the Ministry to carry out the uplifts are shown below

| DISTRICT/ RDP | Name of Transporter |
|------------------|--|
| NORTH | |
| Chitipa | Mulli Brothers, NRTA, Swank Haulage, Progressive Transport, Mwenera, Tuvwanaje |
| Karonga | Mulli Brothers, Lunyina, NRTA, Progressive Transport |
| Rumphi | NRTA, Mulli Brothers, Lunyina, Progressive and Tuvwanaje |
| Nkhata Bay | NRTA, Mulli Brothers, Lunyina, Progressive and Mwenera |
| Mzimba | Mulli, NRTA, Lunyina, Progressive, Swank, Mwenera and Fermak |

CENTRE

| Ntchisi | Mulli Bros, Transporters Assoc. of Mw, RTOA, EB Trucking, LTA, Fermak |
|------------|---|
| Dowa | Mulli Bros, Transporters Assoc. of Mw, RTOA, EB Trucking, LTA, Fermak |
| Mchinji | Mulli Bros, Transporters Assoc. of Mw, RTOA, Salpha, LTA, and Fermak |
| Kasungu | Mulli Bros, Transporters Assoc. of Mw, RTOA, Salpha, LTA, Fermak, Kapiluta and Fayu |
| Salima | Mulli, RTOA, Kapiliuta, TAM and Fermak and EB Trucking |
| Nkhotakota | Mulli, RTOA, TAM, Fermak and Rashy Motors |
| Lilongwe | Mulli, TAM, RTOA, LTA, Salpha, Fermak, Pfuko, Alidere and Kapiliuta |
| Dedza | Mulli, TAM, RTOA, LTA, Fermak, Kapiliuta and FAYU |
| Ntcheu | Mulli, TAM, RTOA, LTA, Fermak, Rashy Motors |

SOUTH

| Balaka | Madna, Mulli, Salpha, RTOA, |
|------------|---|
| Mangochi | Mulli, KC Freight, Madna, Rashy Motors, RTOA, Salpha, |
| Machinga | Mulli, KC Freight, Madna, Rashy Motors, RTOA, Salpha, |
| Zomba | Mulli, KC Freight, Madna, Rashy Motors, RTOA, Salpha, |
| Chiradzulu | Mulli, KC Freight, Madna, RTOA, Salpha, |
| Mwanza | KC Freight, RTOA, |
| Neno | KC Freight, RTOA, |
| Thyolo | Madna, Mulli, KC Freight, RTOA, |
| Phalombe | Madna, Mulli, |
| Mulanje | Madna, Mulli, KC Freight, RTOA, |
| Blantyre | Madna, Mulli, KC Freight, RTOA, Salpha |
| Chikwawa | Mulli, RTOA |
| Nsanje | Mulli, RTOA |

The above list was subsequently increased by the Ministry to include the following transporters; Katondo General Brokers, T.R. Motors, K.K. Properties, Jacaranda Haulage, PEZ General Dealers, Far East Investment Ltd, Mico Transport and C O Mulwafu Transport.

Rates from transporters ranged from MK24/km to MK 35/km.

Following the appointment of the transporters, uplifts commenced on 11th September. However this could only proceed at a limited level as selection of beneficiaries had still to be carried out. Consequently sales could not start and unit markets were quickly saturated.

Sales eventually commenced at the beginning of November at which time it was possible to release the pressure on the SFFRFM depots by resuming full uplifts to the unit markets

The following table indicates the level of uplifts at district level

| District | NPK | Urea | D compound | CAN | Total |
|------------|------------|-----------|------------|----------|------------|
| | 1 7 (1 2 2 | | 1.12.25 | | |
| Chitipa | 1,761.20 | 1,716.25 | 463.95 | 531.35 | 4,472.75 |
| Karonga | 1,659.85 | 1,588.55 | 175.00 | 171.85 | 3,595.25 |
| Rumphi | 2,298.55 | 2,079.65 | 755.60 | 582.00 | 5,715.80 |
| Likoma | 33.00 | 36.00 | - | - | 69.00 |
| Nkhata Bay | 1,015.55 | 1,091.30 | 6.00 | - | 2,112.85 |
| Mzimba | 10,387.90 | 10,721.10 | 1,158.80 | 812.00 | 23,079.80 |
| N.R. Total | 17,156.05 | 17,232.85 | 2,559.35 | 2,097.20 | 39,045.45 |
| | | | | | |
| Kasungu | 5,138.70 | 5,243.30 | 1,324.00 | 1,306.30 | 13,012.30 |
| Mchinji | 3,427.30 | 3,629.05 | 870.05 | 796.00 | 8,722.40 |
| Ntchisi | 1,869.05 | 1,790.00 | 682.95 | 702.00 | 5,044.00 |
| Dowa | 3,946.55 | 4,039.95 | 1,196.90 | 1,072.95 | 10,256.35 |
| Nkhotakota | 1,641.85 | 1,530.00 | 48.55 | 43.00 | 3,263.40 |
| Salima | 2,166.40 | 2,025.85 | 45.00 | 72.00 | 4,309.25 |
| Lilongwe | 7,128.55 | 7,579.70 | 1,136.95 | 1,141.95 | 16,987.15 |
| Dedza | 3,790.35 | 3,715.90 | 266.50 | 272.50 | 8,045.25 |
| Ntcheu | 3,928.75 | 3,740.75 | 235.50 | 250.45 | 8,155.45 |
| C.R. Total | 33,037.50 | 33,294.50 | 5,806.40 | 5,657.15 | 77,795.55 |
| | | | | | |
| Balaka | 2,795.65 | 2,465.60 | 225.85 | 486.90 | 5,974.00 |
| Mangochi | 5,215.65 | 5,257.95 | 340.30 | 292.30 | 11,106.20 |
| Machinga | 4,348.30 | 4,497.10 | 543.00 | 798.00 | 10,186.40 |
| Zomba | 5,483.15 | 4,773.75 | 201.20 | 254.80 | 10,712.90 |
| Chiradzulu | 2,298.25 | 2,661.75 | 105.00 | 69.00 | 5,134.00 |
| Phalombe | 3,350.05 | 3,721.55 | 139.50 | 85.45 | 7,296.55 |
| Mulanje | 4,096.20 | 5,040.60 | 40.00 | 30.00 | 9,206.80 |
| Thyolo | 6,707.75 | 6,797.70 | 264.00 | 93.00 | 13,862.45 |
| Blantyre | 4,747.80 | 4,570.55 | 210.90 | 83.60 | 9,612.85 |
| Mwanza | 932.50 | 1,105.25 | 56.00 | - | 2,093.75 |
| Neno | 731.45 | 786.95 | - | - | 1,518.40 |
| Chikwawa | 879.00 | 613.20 | - | - | 1,492.20 |
| Nsanje | 719.90 | 783.95 | - | - | 1,503.85 |
| S.R. Total | 42,305.65 | 43,075.90 | 2,125.75 | 2,193.05 | 89,700.35 |
| | , | , | , | , | , |
| Total | 92,499.20 | 93,603.25 | 10,491.50 | 9,947.40 | 206,541.35 |

The above table includes 820 MTS of fertiliser that was made available to the Millenium Village projects and therefore never went to ADMARC or SFFRFM unit markets

It will be noted that because of some imbalance in the amount of fertiliser delivered to the individual depots, there was a need for some inter depot transfers. In all these totalled 2,875 MTS at a cost of MK 42,045,643.

There were also some transit losses but the vast majority of these were recovered either by the transporter physically replacing the loss or by deductions being made from invoices due. Unrecovered losses amounted to 126 MTS valued at MK 15,813,215. The transporters where recovery is outstanding are listed below

| Transporter | Amount MK |
|-------------|------------|
| PTIA | 37,772 |
| TAM | 6,419,067 |
| TR Motors | 7,080,334 |
| Katondo | 2,276,042 |
| Total | 15,813,215 |

The average cost /MT of delivering fertiliser to just over 800 ADMARC/SFFRFM selling points throughout the country was \$40.70/MT. The cost /MT in US \$ for the individual districts is given below

| | Cost |
|------------|-----------|
| District | (US\$)/MT |
| Balaka | 35.11 |
| Blantyre | 17.36 |
| Chikwawa | 29.76 |
| Chiradzulu | 18.03 |
| Chitipa | 117.89 |
| Dedza | 30.28 |
| Dowa | 21.40 |
| Karonga | 45.73 |
| Kasungu | 39.21 |
| Lilongwe | 18.33 |
| Machinga | 59.35 |
| Mangochi | 76.73 |
| Mchinji | 35.90 |
| Mulanje | 35.05 |
| Mwanza | 34.04 |
| Mzimba | 42.27 |
| Neno | 36.17 |
| NkhataBay | 26.46 |
| nkhotakota | 61.94 |
| Nsanje | 50.88 |
| Ntcheu | 51.98 |
| Ntchisi | 29.52 |
| Phalombe | 48.57 |
| Rumphi | 23.86 |
| Salima | 27.06 |
| Thyolo | 28.93 |
| Zomba | 31.35 |

Voucher Printing and Distribution

In the previous subsidy projects the printing of the vouchers had been carried out by local printers following a selective tender process. However, it was appreciated that this year the enormous increase in the price of fertiliser had resulted in an equally enormous increase in the value of each voucher. Consequently the temptation to produce fraudulent youchers had also soared.

As a result, the printing of the vouchers was the subject of much discussion right from the early stages of the project. Concern was expressed by all parties about the need for high quality security features in this year's vouchers and offers from various donors to pay for the purchase of security paper etc were on the table.

Commencement of the printing of the vouchers is dependent on the decision being made on district allocations as the vouchers are identified by district through the use of the district vehicle registration prefix. The initial decision on district allocation was finally made in mid September. At the task force meting of 6th October, it was revealed that the printing of the vouchers was complete. It was also announced that distribution of the vouchers would be implemented by the DADOs.

As a consequence, the Logistics Unit had to deliver the completed beneficiary registers to the Ministry of Agriculture who carried these plus the vouchers to the respective districts. The DADOs then distributed the vouchers in accordance with the names in the registers. However it is believed that distributing agents(DADO staff) did not follow the original intention to ensure that each beneficiary received the same voucher number as the one appearing against his/her name in the register. As a result in will not be possible to say exactly who received or redeemed each voucher.

In addition, the total of 390,000 vouchers (NPK, urea, maize) listed as "unallocated" did not have any district specific prefix. These could therefore be issued or surrendered in any district thus further increasing the difficulties of tracing their origin. It would also appear that a larger number of "unallocated" vouchers were printed than the 390,000 shown in the initial beneficiary list. The total district numbers advised by the Ministry as being distributed indicate that a minimum of 900,000 "unallocated" vouchers were available for distribution.

A further twist in the voucher printing programme came on 8th November when it was announced that the original vouchers (believed to have been printed in the Government Print) were considered to be insecure and would therefore not be distributed in the Central and Northern Regions. Instead a voucher, understood to have been printed in RSA, was introduced containing enhanced security features.

Beneficiary Selection

The beneficiary selection exercise was executed in the following manner:

Initially, in late May, all districts were supplied with an electronic copy of the 2007 farm family list and asked to update it. DFID agreed to fund this exercise, but for a number of reasons funds were not made available until early August. However a number of districts commenced the exercise using their own funding. This was eventually reimbursed when a total of MK 80,358,814.00 was made available.

On completion of this exercise an electronic edition of the update was provided to the Logistics Unit by each district.

This was cleaned at the Unit and returned to the district with a request that the accuracy be confirmed.

District response to these requests varied but by the end of August, all districts had completed the update and a number had signed off on the Logistics Unit's request for confirmation of accuracy.

The Ministry of Agriculture produced the following beneficiary district allocation list on 12th September indicating the numbers to be selected for each category of voucher

| District | NPK UREA | ТОВАССО | Flexible |
|-------------|----------|---------|----------|
| | MAIZE | | |
| Chitipa | 25,259 | 8,541 | 14,238 |
| Karonga | 21,831 | 3,207 | 16,988 |
| Rumphi | 26,400 | 12,180 | 14,790 |
| Likoma | 640 | | 595 |
| Nkhata Bay | 21,896 | 200 | 15,787 |
| Mzimba | 70,500 | 19,080 | 72,877 |
| Kasungu | 79,618 | 25,470 | 55,074 |
| Mchinji | 62,500 | 17,560 | 41,732 |
| Ntchisi | 30,000 | 14,080 | 25,138 |
| Dowa | 68,700 | 24,500 | 40,411 |
| Nkhota Kota | 24,784 | 714 | 20,602 |
| Salima | 34,500 | 1,102 | 24,080 |
| Lilongwe | 118,789 | 20,818 | 113,542 |
| Dedza | 65,050 | 5,039 | 51,573 |
| Ntcheu | 67,500 | 5,175 | 39,739 |
| Balaka | 40,841 | 2,819 | 27,446 |
| Mangochi | 50,088 | 4,920 | 64,896 |
| Machinga | 62,315 | 4,990 | 44,583 |
| Zomba | 74,387 | 8,510 | 54,066 |
| Chiradzulu | 55,359 | 4,596 | 25,482 |
| Phalombe | 71,273 | 5,784 | 25,795 |
| Mulanje | 69,093 | 978 | 54,121 |
| Thyolo | 88,302 | 2,942 | 49,437 |
| Blantyre | 83,661 | 5,565 | 40,370 |
| Mwanza | 21,802 | 875 | 10,211 |
| Neno | 12,868 | 355 | 8,609 |
| Chikwawa | 11,074 | | 30,615 |

| Nsanje | 10,970 | | 17,204 |
|-------------|-----------|---------|-----------|
| Unallocated | 130,000 | | |
| Total | 1,500,000 | 200,000 | 1,000,000 |

These numbers were broken down by the Logistics Unit to EPA level (and subsequently, to village level). Where possible this was done by using the village information provided by the districts for the 2009 farm family updating exercise. However 13 districts had not supplied village level data. Consequently, previous year's database information was used to provide the required village level breakdown required by the Ministry of Agriculture.

This information plus blank beneficiary registers printed to permit beneficiary names to be entered by village was circulated to the respective DADOs

By end of September all districts were in possession of this information and the selection of beneficiaries was underway. However many districts complained they were hampered by the lack of finance to carry out the beneficiary selection exercise

The information on beneficiary selection collected in the field was merged and recorded at district headquarters and conveyed to the Logistics Unit in electronic form.

At the Logistics Unit the information provided was further checked and cleaned to ensure that the total number of names agreed with the district allocations provided by the Ministry of Agriculture. Beneficiary distribution registers providing beneficiary names at village level were then printed.

These registers were delivered to the Subsidy secretariat at Ministry of Agriculture Headquarters as the secretariat was to be the body responsible for the eventual distribution of the vouchers.

The first of the completed beneficiary registers (Blantyre ADD) was delivered to the Ministry of Agriculture on 18th October and delivery of the final registers (Mzimba) took place on 6th December.

Points to Note

Although the districts were advised of the breakdown of the district allocation to EPA and village level, in almost all districts the allocations made by the DADOs when completing the beneficiary list differed from the information provided.

During the beneficiary selection process the Ministry of Agriculture advised some districts (Mzimba, Mangochi, Nkhotakota and Nsanje) of a number of additions to the original district allocation.

In Mangochi there was some resistance by traditional leaders to accepting the vouchers. This resulted in under registration in that district. Also Phalombe and Machinga district did not fully utilise the allocation for flexible coupons while in Salima an administrative error resulted in over registration in that category

As a consequence districts eventually produced lists covering the number of beneficiaries shown in the following table

| District | NPK UREA MAIZE | ТОВАССО | Flexible | Additional NPK/Urea only |
|-------------|----------------------|---------|-----------|--------------------------------|
| Chitipa | 25,259 | 8,541 | 14,238 | |
| Karonga | 21,831 | 3,207 | 16,988 | |
| Rumphi | 26,400 | 12,180 | 14,790 | |
| Likoma | 640 | | 595 | |
| Nkhata Bay | 21,895 | 200 | 15,786 | |
| Mzimba | 93,500 | 19,080 | 72,877 | |
| Kasungu | 79,618 | 25,470 | 55,074 | |
| Mchinji | 62,500 | 17,560 | 41,732 | |
| Ntchisi | 30,000 | 14,080 | 25,138 | |
| Dowa | 68,700 | 24,500 | 40,411 | |
| Nkhota Kota | 24,784 | 715 | 20,602 | 3,000 |
| Salima | 34,500 | 1,102 | 25,675 | |
| Lilongwe | 118,789 | 20,818 | 113,542 | |
| Dedza | 65,050 | 5,039 | 51,573 | |
| Ntcheu | 67,500 | 5,175 | 39,739 | |
| Balaka | 40,841 | 2,820 | 27,446 | |
| Mangochi | 71,088 | 4,920 | 64,896 | |
| Machinga | 60,207 | 4,657 | 42,351 | |
| Zomba | 74,387 | 8,510 | 54,066 | |
| Chiradzulu | 55,359 | 4,596 | 25,482 | |
| Phalombe | 71,273 | 5,784 | 22,788 | |
| Mulanje | 69,093 | 978 | 54,120 | |
| Thyolo | 88,302 | 2,942 | 49,437 | |
| Blantyre | 83,661 | 5,565 | 40,370 | |
| Mwanza | 21,802 | 875 | 10,211 | |
| Neno | 12,868 | 355 | 8,609 | |
| Chikwawa | 11,074 | | 30,615 | |
| Nsanje | 11,060 | | 17,204 | 314 |
| Unallocated | 84,705 | 331 | 3,645 | |
| Total | 1,500,000 | 200,000 | 1,000,000 | 3,314 |

In general the registration process as implemented by the DADOs remained true to the total numbers indicated as being that allocated to their district for the particular category, although as previously noted, allocations within the district varied quite considerably from the guidelines provided by the Ministry through the Logistics Unit.

However the registration process took a new twist in mid December when the Ministry indicated that additional vouchers were to be distributed in the districts. This allocation

amounted to a further 118,471 each of NPK and Urea vouchers and 68,486 maize vouchers.

Then in early January the Ministry advised that there had been a further issue of vouchers resulting in the table below

| Division | New NPK/Urea | New Maize | Additional NPK/Urea | Addition maize |
|---------------------|-------------------|-------------------|------------------------|----------------|
| District Chitipa | allocation 29,950 | allocation 25,869 | names 4,691 | names 610 |
| Karonga | 33,872 | 22,291 | 12,041 | 460 |
| Rumphi | 33,731 | 30,650 | 7,331 | 4,250 |
| Likoma | 2,261 | 680 | 1,619 | 38 |
| Nkhata Bay | 30,147 | 22,566 | 8,252 | 671 |
| Mzimba | 190,421 | 96,840 | 96,921 | 3,340 |
| Wizimoa | 170,421 | 70,040 | 70,721 | 5,540 |
| Kasungu | 101,109 | 82,528 | 21,491 | 2,910 |
| Mchinji | 71,201 | 63,200 | 8,701 | 700 |
| Ntchisi | 36,081 | 30,900 | 6,081 | 900 |
| Dowa | 77,991 | 70,910 | 9,291 | 2,210 |
| Nkhotakota | 37,535 | 28,454 | 12,751 | 3,670 |
| Salima | 40,761 | 36,180 | 6,261 | 1,680 |
| Lilongwe | 141,010 | 124,429 | 22,221 | 5,640 |
| Dedza | 70,781 | 66,800 | 5,731 | 1,750 |
| Ntcheu | 74,851 | 68,270 | 7,351 | 770 |
| | | | | |
| Balaka | 46,969 | 40,911 | 6,128 | 70 |
| Mangochi | 78,778 | 71,178 | 7,690 | 90 |
| Machinga | 74,447 | 63,455 | 14,240 | 3,248 |
| Zomba | 87,328 | 74,497 | 12,941 | 110 |
| Chiradzulu | 60,242 | 55,559 | 4,883 | 200 |
| Phalombe | 75,676 | 71,704 | 4,403 | 431 |
| Mulanje | 84,155 | 73,153 | 15,062 | 4,060 |
| Thyolo | 123,014 | 118,022 | 34,712 | 29,720 |
| Blantyre | 89,125 | 83,741 | 5,464 | 80 |
| Mwanza | 22,146 | 21,832 | 344 | 30 |
| Neno | 16,918 | 16,918 | 4,050 | 4,050 |
| Chikwawa | 11,812 | 11,184 | 738 | 110 |
| Nsanje | 11,374 | 11,060 | 404 | 90 |
| Total | 1,753,686 | 1,500,000 | 341,793 | 71,888 |

This further issue meant that 338,391 NPK, 338,391 Urea and 84,705 maize vouchers had been issued to beneficiaries other than those whose names were in the beneficiary registers. It has not proved possible to identify the channels through which these coupons were distributed or the identity of those who received them.

In addition 11,000 Urea coupons were made available for issue to smallholder tea growers in Mulanje/Thyolo and 4,000 vouchers each of NPK and Urea went to the Northern Region for issue to smallholder coffee growers.

Redemption of Vouchers, Sales and Stock balances In Markets

A considerable departure from the procedure of previous years' subsidy programmes was the exclusion of private retailers as agents for the sale of fertiliser through the voucher scheme. Initially the various work plans for the 2008/2009 subsidy programme had included private retailers and as late as mid October 2008 contracts had been issued to selected retailers. However these were withdrawn and on 6th November 2008 an announcement was made that the agents for sales of fertiliser through the subsidy scheme would be ADMARC and SFFRFM only. The private sectors involvement in the direct sale of subsidy products to the farmers was to be limited to the various seed companies for the maize seed and flexible vouchers.

Sales for the subsidised products commenced on 3rd November 2008 in the southern Region. At the same time an independent monitoring service was commissioned using DFID funding. The monitors (Mulli Brothers) were responsible for producing a weekly report to the Logistics Unit that covered fertiliser arrivals and sales for each of the unit markets opened by SFFRFM and ADMARC. Sales ceased on 6th February in the South and Central and continues until 1`2th February in the Northern region.

Vouchers arising from sales had to be returned to the Logistics Unit for recording and, in the case of seed, reimbursing. The first vouchers (seed) were returned to the Logistics Unit on 6th November 2008. However no fertiliser vouchers from either ADMARC or SFFRFM were received until the first week in December at which point over 160,000 MTS fertiliser had already been sold. Vouchers for both seed and fertiliser continued to be submitted until the last week in April

Fertiliser Sales

Set out below are tables indicating the level of presumed sales by district It is arrived at by reducing the uplifts taken into the district by the balances ADMARC has declared as being left in the district. SFFRFM sold all available stocks in their unit markets. It should be noted that the uplift of ADMARC balances in the Northern region and southern region have yet to be confirmed as physical uplift had not been completed at date of issuing this final report.

The uplift figures for Thyolo, Mulanje and the Northern Region (except Mzimba district) have been credited with the fertiliser provided to the smallholder tea and coffee growers. It is believed that the vouchers given to them (19,000 in number) were surrendered to SFFRFM

| | | ADMARC declared | |
|------------|------------|-----------------|------------|
| District | Uplifts | balances | Sales |
| Chitipa | 4,472.75 | 283.00 | 4,189.75 |
| Karonga | 3,595.25 | 370.70 | 3,224.55 |
| Rumphi | 5,715.80 | 466.90 | 5,248.90 |
| Likoma | 69.00 | | 69.00 |
| Nkhata Bay | 2,112.85 | 275.20 | 1,837.65 |
| Mzimba | 23,079.80 | 977.80 | 22,102.00 |
| | | | |
| Kasungu | 13,012.30 | | 13,012.30 |
| Mchinji | 8,602.40 | | 8,602.40 |
| Ntchisi | 5,044.00 | | 5,044.00 |
| Dowa | 10,256.35 | 5.00 | 10,251.35 |
| Nkhotakota | 3,263.40 | 20.55 | 3,242.85 |
| Salima | 4,309.25 | | 4,309.25 |
| Lilongwe | 16,987.15 | 11.35 | 16,975.80 |
| Dedza | 8,045.25 | 11.65 | 8,033.60 |
| Ntcheu | 8,155.45 | 103.85 | 8,051.60 |
| | | | |
| Balaka | 5,974.00 | 156.80 | 5,817.20 |
| Mangochi | 11,106.20 | 448.10 | 10,658.10 |
| Machinga | 10,186.40 | 92.80 | 10,093.60 |
| Zomba | 10,012.90 | 113.75 | 9,899.15 |
| Chiradzulu | 5,134.00 | 16.10 | 5,117.90 |
| Phalombe | 7,296.55 | 21.20 | ,275.35 |
| Mulanje | 9,206.80 | 17.40 | 9,189.40 |
| Thyolo | 13,862.45 | 5.35 | 13,857.10 |
| Blantyre | 9,612.85 | 7.60 | 9,605.25 |
| Mwanza | 2,093.75 | 11.20 | 2,082.55 |
| Neno | 1,518.40 | 11.20 | 1,507.20 |
| Chikwawa | 1,492.20 | 8.01 | 1,484.19 |
| Nsanje | 1,503.85 | 8.00 | 1,495.85 |
| Total | 205,721.35 | 3,443.51 | 202,277.84 |

Attempts to compare sales against voucher returns on a district basis proved pointless for the following reasons . Non prefixed vouchers could be traded in any district . In addition there were movements of fertiliser between markets that meant the amounts available for sale could differ from the theoretical figures produced above

However, on a regional basis, separating the figures for ADMARC from SFFRFM reveals the following

| ADMARC | Uplifts | ADMARC declared balances | Sales | Vouchers Recovered (MTS) |
|----------|------------|--------------------------|------------|--------------------------------|
| Southern | 75,898.40 | 917.51 | 74,980.89 | 70,863.00 |
| Central | 66,410.40 | 152.40 | 66,258.00 | 64,441.80 |
| North | 30,215.70 | 2,373.60 | 27,842.10 | 28,790.45 |
| Total | 172,524.50 | 3,443.51 | 169,080.99 | 164,095.25 |

| SFFRFM | Uplifts | Sales | Vouchers Recovered (MTS) |
|----------|-----------|-----------|--------------------------------|
| Southern | 13,101.95 | 13,101.95 | 11,814.05 |
| Central | 11,185.15 | 11,185.15 | 12,852.70 |
| North | 8,909.75 | 8,909.75 | 9,292.85 |
| Total | 33,196.85 | 33,196.85 | 33,959.60 |

Such differences as there were between total sales and total voucher returns occurred in ADMARC markets and these only amounted to 4,223 MTS, namely 2% of total sales.

Seed Sales

The system of providing improved seed to farmers through the subsidy programme and the subsequent redemption of the vouchers was entirely different from the fertiliser. The seed was free to the farmer. Seed companies who took part in the scheme (seed Co, Pannar, Monsanto, AISAM, Demeter, Funwe) stocked outlets with packets of seed which were either 2kgs hybrid or 4kgs OPV. The outlets ranged from private agro dealers to the seed companies own shops to ADMARC/SFFRFM unit markets. The farmer surrendered his maize voucher for seed of his/her choice. The seed companies were then responsible for collecting the vouchers from the outlets and submitting these to the Logistics Unit for recording and reimbursement at the rate of MK 680/voucher. The following table shows the result of this exercise.

| | Maize Vouchers | Maize Vouchers |
|------------|-------------------|-------------------|
| District | allocated | redeemed |
| Chitipa | 25,869 | 32,901 |
| Karonga | 22,291 | 28,049 |
| Rumphi | 30,650 | 26,100 |
| Likoma | 680 | 659 |
| Nkhata Bay | 22,566 | 15,818 |
| Mzimba | 96,840 | 125,808 |
| | | |
| Kasungu | 82,528 | 74,875 |
| Mchinji | 63,200 | 66,473 |
| Ntchisi | 30,900 | 33,174 |

| Dowa | 70,910 | 76,643 |
|------------|-----------|-----------|
| Nkhotakota | 28,454 | 31,077 |
| Salima | 36,180 | 36,938 |
| Lilongwe | 124,429 | 126,163 |
| Dedza | 66,800 | 81,716 |
| Ntcheu | 68,270 | 57,380 |
| | | |
| Balaka | 40,911 | 45,291 |
| Mangochi | 71,178 | 63,400 |
| Machinga | 63,455 | 62,447 |
| Zomba | 74,497 | 83,272 |
| Chiradzulu | 55,559 | 60,482 |
| Phalombe | 71,704 | 71,546 |
| Mulanje | 73,153 | 78,809 |
| Thyolo | 118,022 | 136,120 |
| Blantyre | 83,741 | 87,879 |
| Mwanza | 21,832 | 21,698 |
| Neno | 16,918 | 13,111 |
| Chikwawa | 11,184 | 11,750 |
| Nsanje | 11,060 | 11,750 |
| Total | 1,500,000 | 1,561,329 |

In addition to the maize vouchers that were given to farmers who received fertiliser vouchers, 1 million flexible vouchers were to be available for issue. These could be redeemed by farmers for seed of their choice from a basket comprising maize seed (hybrid and OPV), cotton seed, bean seed, pigeon peas. The following table shows the redemption success of this exercise

| | Flexible Vouchers | Flexible Vouchers |
|------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| District | Allocated | redeemed |
| Chitipa | 14,238 | 11,328 |
| Karonga | 16,988 | 12,683 |
| Rumphi | 14,790 | 11,801 |
| Likoma | 595 | 535 |
| Nkhata Bay | 15,787 | 12,287 |
| Mzimba | 72,877 | 61,052 |

| Kasungu | 55,074 | 44,734 |
|---------|--------|--------|
| Mchinji | 41,732 | 54,244 |
| Ntchisi | 25,138 | 22,822 |
| Dowa | 40,411 | 48,178 |

| Nkhotakota | 20,602 | 21,096 |
|------------|-----------|-----------|
| Salima | 24,080 | 25,346 |
| Lilongwe | 113,542 | 172,907 |
| Dedza | 51,573 | 44,495 |
| Ntcheu | 39,739 | 28,406 |
| | | |
| Balaka | 27,446 | 17,363 |
| Mangochi | 64,896 | 64,301 |
| Machinga | 44,583 | 34,363 |
| Zomba | 54,066 | 52,129 |
| Chiradzulu | 25,482 | 25,515 |
| Phalombe | 25,795 | 24,912 |
| Mulanje | 54,121 | 59,626 |
| Thyolo | 49,437 | 47,130 |
| Blantyre | 40,370 | 43,134 |
| Mwanza | 10,211 | 23,062 |
| Neno | 8,609 | 7,481 |
| Chikwawa | 30,615 | 30,207 |
| Nsanje | 17,204 | 15,473 |
| Total | 1,000,000 | 1,016,610 |

Although the flexible vouchers permitted freedom of choice of seed., the vast majority of the vouchers were redeemed for maize seed. The emphasis was much more on hybrid than in previous years with 4,532 MTS of hybrid being selected against 833 MTS OPV.

Records indicate that only 8,852 were redeemed for other seeds. The table below gives the breakdown.

| Cotton | 8,536 |
|-------------|-------|
| Beans | 86 |
| Groundnuts | 9 |
| Pigeon peas | 221 |

As in the case of the fertiliser vouchers, little benefit can be derived from a comparison of the apparent district allocation with the district redemption because of the non prefixed vouchers that can be surrendered in any district. However it would seem that more seed vouchers were in circulation than those that the ministry of Agriculture advised as having been printed resulting in 103% redemption of the seed vouchers

Programme Costs

Expenditure incurred in the project was handled in various ways. The invoices for all fertiliser purchases, seed voucher reimbursement and internal transport costs came through the Logistics Unit for checking and was then passed to Government (Ministry of Agriculture or Treasury) for payment. Payment for voucher printing, operational costs

for ADMARC/SFFRFM and the Ministry of Agriculture operational expenditure was met directly by the Ministry and are unknown to the Logistics Unit. There was also the cost of repurchasing the 2007. Logistics Unit operational costs were paid directly by the Unit from funds provided to the Government by DFID. The following table reflects this situation

Known Inputs Subsidy Programme Costs

| Flexible voucher returns | 726,577,966.00 |
|--|-------------------|
| Seed voucher returns | 1,013,566,700.00 |
| Fertiliser "Buy back" costs from 2007/08 | 3,482,982,390.00 |
| Fertiliser supplier costs | 33,268,171,569.00 |
| Transport Costs* | 1,293,749,348.00 |
| Logistics Unit operational costs | 33,868,647.00 |
| Computers for ADMARC | 9,081,742.00 |
| Total known costs | 39,827,998,362.00 |

^{*}The transport costs listed are incomplete as they do not include all the costs of retrieving the surplus fertiliser from the unit markets.

In addition to the above costs, as previously indicated Government arranged the purchase of 24,500 MTS of "flood relief" fertiliser at a cost of MK 4,296,996,393.

The sum of MK 80,358,814 provided by DFID to fund the updating of the 2007 farm family data is not included in the above as it is considered that this is a standard exercise that should not be debited against the programme.

Unknown Inputs Subsidy Programme Costs

| Operations costs SFFRFM/ADMARC | ?????? |
|--|--------|
| Ministry HQ and district operational costs | ?????? |
| Voucher Production costs | ?????? |
| Balance of retrieval costs from unit markets | ?????? |
| Cotton chemical voucher redemption | ?????? |
| Bank Charges on 2007/2008 "buy back" stocks | ?????? |

At the date of publishing this report a number of presented invoices remain unpaid. These are summarised below

| Fertiliser | 2,867,209,263.7 |
|-----------------|------------------|
| Cotton vouchers | 4,170,440.00 |
| Maize vouchers | 240,203,980.00 |
| Transporters | 80,286,470.44 |
| Total | 3,191,870,154.10 |